

A Reprint from *Tierra Grande*

Shock Treatment

Negotiating Transmission Line Easements

By Judon Fambrough

Condemnation constantly threatens private landowners. Every year pipelines and power lines weave a tighter and tighter web across the landscape.

The Trans-Texas Corridor threatened to take massive amounts of land for transportation purposes before the project was scrapped. Now, with wind turbines sprouting up across Texas, the need for transmission lines sets the stage for more condemnation of private land.

Texas wind farms can generate about 8,000 megawatts (MW), but existing transmission lines can carry approximately 4,500 MWs. Plans are underway to construct 2,334 miles of lines to transport an additional 18,456 MWs. The project anticipates taking over 56,000 acres.

This article discusses the condemnation process in Texas and highlights issues landowners need to address to protect their property and property rights.

Three-Stage Process

Texas law divides condemnation into three stages. The first stage is devoid of court involvement. Past judicial interpretation of Chapter 21 of the Texas Property Code indicated that the condemnor must attempt to purchase the needed land in lieu of condemnation. This required condemnors to make a bona fide effort to purchase the land based on its fair market value.

The Texas Supreme Court modified this requirement in 2004 (*Hubenak v. San Jacinto Gas Transmission Co.*).

The court ruled that, “The dollar amount of the condemnor’s offer should not be scrutinized nor compared with other indications of value. A single offer by the condemnor satisfies the requirement regardless of the amount.”

Thus, condemnors are no longer obliged to offer fair market value in the first stage. Whether they must negotiate in good faith is questionable.

If the parties agree on a purchase price (or “damages” as it is referred to in the statute) in lieu of condemnation, the process ends. Otherwise, it moves to the next stage.

Stage 2 begins with the condemnor petitioning the court for the appointment of three disinterested landowners, better known as special commissioners, to conduct a hearing to determine damages from the proposed taking. The commissioners hear evidence from both parties before posting an award. Landowners do not need an attorney for the hearing, but the assistance of an appraiser is recommended.

After the commissioners make their decision, the condemnor may start construction of the project by posting adequate security with the court. The construction continues even though either party may appeal the commissioners’ decision.

Stage 3 begins when either party appeals the matter to the court. If neither party appeals, the process concludes. If appealed, landowners need both an attorney and an appraiser for representation. The attorney fees and the appraiser fees cannot be recovered as part of a judgment even when the landowners prevail. Stage 3

ends when no further judicial appeals occur. The appeals cannot go beyond the Texas Supreme Court. (For more details on the condemnation process, see “Understanding the Condemnation Process in Texas,” recenter.tamu.edu/pdf/394.pdf.)

Four Condemnation Limitations

Texas law imposes four restraints on the condemnation process.

First, the taking must support some public purpose or bestow some public benefit. Land cannot be condemned for private purposes. However, the U.S. Supreme Court recently approved condemnation solely for economic development in the Kelo decision. In 2009, Texas voters limited this ruling, to some degree, with the passage of a constitutional amendment.

Texas law imposes four restraints on the condemnation process. First, the taking must support some public purpose or bestow some public benefit.

Second, the condemnor cannot take more land or property rights than are reasonably needed for the project. This is known as the public necessity limitation. For example, a pipeline company cannot condemn a 50-foot easement when a 30-foot easement is needed. However, the Hubenak case mentioned earlier modifies this limitation.

While the condemnor cannot condemn more than is reasonably needed, the high court permits the condemnor to attempt to purchase more than this in Stage 1

as long as it is generally related to the project. For example, the condemnor may attempt to purchase the 50-foot easement to transport both natural gas and crude oil when only a 30-foot easement is needed to transport natural gas. According to Hubenak, it is up to the landowners to narrow the offer to what is reasonably needed during Stage 1.

Third, the condemnor is supposed to pay the landowner “just compensation” or fair market value for the property. As discussed earlier, this may no longer be the case after Hubenak. Landowners will receive compensation but not necessarily fair market value.

Fourth, the condemnor must adhere strictly to the three-stage condemnation process described in the previous section. This is better

known as the due-process limitation.

Rules of Engagement

Hubenak severely limited landowners’ rights in condemnation. Consequently, landowners must remember the following rules.

First, the condemnor is not required to offer fair market value or possibly to negotiate in good faith in Stage 1. Second, the condemnor may attempt to purchase more land and property rights in Stage 1 than can later be condemned in Stage 3. Finally,

landowners cannot recover attorney fees or expert witness fees if they contest the matter beyond Stage 1. (For more information about the Hubenak decision, see “This Property Condemned: What Landowners Should Know About Changing Property Rights,” recenter.tamu.edu/pdf/1710.pdf.)

So, what should landowners do when confronted with condemnation for transmission lines?

First, they must resist the temptation to focus entirely on the amount of money being offered. While money is important, landowners must not overlook the rights the condemnor is attempting to purchase in lieu of condemnation in Stage 1.

The rights the condemnor attempts to purchase in lieu of condemnation are outlined in the initial written proposal presented to landowners entitled “Right-of-Way Easement” or simply “Transmission Line Easement.” Read it carefully. Limit the proposal to the property and property rights reasonably needed for the transmission line project.

Hubenak represents a mixed bag for landowners. While it removes certain rights, it impliedly guarantees others. Basically, the high court directs condemnors to negotiate with landowners when attempting to purchase more than it can condemn. When this occurs, the court directs landowners to:

- Point out in Stage 1 that the condemnor is trying to purchase more than it can condemn. This violates the public-necessity limitation discussed earlier. Make a material issue of this fact. If not

raised in Stage 1, the issue cannot be addressed in Stage 3 should the process go that far.

- List and value the rights that cannot be condemned and offer to accept the condemnor's proposal if these rights are dropped or purchased separately.

But how do landowners discern between what property and property rights are reasonably needed for a project? These facts appear to be within the domain

condemnor's CCN or find it online. The dimensions just described should then be inserted into the proposed easement agreement. The agreement should state these specifications are the maximums allowed.

For example, "This easement cannot exceed ___ feet in width, ___ feet in height, contain more than ___ conductors to transport ___ kV of electricity. Only ___ type of poles or supports may be used."

following suggestions, but they should try.

Never grant an exclusive easement. Always retain the right to grant joint use or occupancy of the easement as long as it does not unreasonably interfere with the condemnor's usage. Never grant a permanent, perpetual or irrevocable easement. The adverse legal consequences of doing so are beyond the scope of this article.

If the proposal allows the installation of communication equipment or facilities (telecommunication or otherwise), limit them to private, nonpublic use. Otherwise, commercial use is allowed without additional compensation.

Limit the easement to overhead lines only if this is what the landowner desires. The proposal may permit both above-ground and underground lines.

Terminate the easement if not used continuously for a specific number of months. Never rely on abandonment to terminate the easement. The legal definition of the term includes more than just nonuse. Require

the condemnor to remove all equipment and fixtures and reclaim the land and pay damages, once the easement ends.

Specify what structures the landowner may place within the easement. For example, are fences, livestock pens, deer blinds and feeders permitted? Are there any height limitations to these structures? This is particularly important with deer-proof fences. Must the fences and blinds be grounded, and if so, who will do it?

Are there any limitations on the activities the landowner may undertake within the easement? This depends

in part on whether or not the landowner grants an exclusive or nonexclusive easement. Are farming and ranching practices permitted?

In addition to payment for the easement, include compensation for each structure placed on the property (each pole, guy wire and so on). If not, limit permitted structures to those placed within the easement during the construction phase. After that, require compensation for any structures added.

In all likelihood, the condemnor will assign the easement to another entity in the future. Require notification of the assignment as a condition for it to become binding on the landowner.

Miscellaneous Issues

Here are some issues that might be overlooked by those with no experience in negotiating easements.

What must the condemnor do with trees and brush removed from the easement? Must they be stacked and burned, shredded or buried? Must larger trees be cut and piled for firewood? Require that rocks exceeding a certain diameter be removed and stacked at locations designated by the landowner. Require that berms and terraces be constructed on steep slopes to prevent erosion.

Do not allow the condemnor to enter and leave the premises wherever and whenever it pleases. Limit access solely to and through the easement. Temporary access outside the easement may be granted for additional compensation during the construction phase.

After the construction phase ends, require the condemnor to change the locks on all gates and give 24-



of the condemnor, not the landowner. To some degree, the answer lies in the public domain if landowners know where to look.

Before a company can condemn property for transmission lines, it must first secure a permit from the Public Utility Commission of Texas. This permit, better known as a Certificate of Convenience and Necessity (CCN), contains among other things the height, width, voltage, number of wires (conductors), and the type of supports (poles) needed for the project.

So, initially, landowners should ask for a copy of the

Just because the CCN contains these dimensions does not mean they automatically become a part of the proposed agreement. Remember, the high court allows the condemnor to attempt to purchase much more than it can condemn. It is incumbent on the landowner to narrow the agreement before signing.

Other Limitations

A number of important other considerations should be addressed in the agreement. Landowners may not be able to get the condemnor to agree to all the

48-hour advance notice of any subsequent entry except during emergencies.

Never warrant title to the land. Specify the condemnor takes the title to the easement solely at its risk. If title fails, the landowner will not be required to return any consideration.

Require welding crews to carry firefighting equipment or be accompanied by water trucks with high-pressure sprayers to prevent range fires. Make the condemnor liable for any fire damage resulting from its operations.

Get an indemnification agreement for tort and environmental liability caused by the condemnor's activities. Require inclusion as an additional insured under the condemnor's liability policy.

Insert "Time is of the Essence" in the agreement. Without this language, there are no hard and fast deadlines. (For more information, consult "Calculating Time in Promulgated Forms," recenter.tamu.edu/pdf/1333.pdf.)

Insert a "Favored Nations Clause" to ensure no other landowner gets a better deal in the area. (This provision is difficult to get.)

Deny any rights to hunt and fish on the property.

Require all fences be braced before cutting. Specify how the braces will be constructed. Require the condemnor to install and maintain gates where fences are cut. Landowners may require a specific local contractor to do all fence work, gate installation and other similar work.

Never allow for relocation of power lines within the easement. The lines must remain in the center of the easement as nearly as possible.

Require the landowner's permission to remove deer

blinds and feeders from the easement during the construction period. Otherwise, they could be bulldozed or destroyed.

Specify that the condemnor takes subject to any and all existing easements, both visible and those of record. Also, it takes subject to all surface, wind, water and mineral leases on the property.

Compensation for Damages

Never agree that the initial, lump-sum payment for the easement covers all damages. Present damages may be covered but not future damages. Many items related to damages need to be addressed.

Landowners should not allow the condemnor to enter and leave the premises wherever and whenever it pleases.

Make sure compensation includes damages outside the easement. Blasting, use of heavy equipment or both may collapse shallow aquifers, cause springs and wells to go dry and pond and tank dams to leak. For this reason, blasting may be prohibited.

If the condemnor needs a water source, specify where it can be obtained and the cost if the landowner desires to sell. Otherwise, prohibit any water from being taken.

Require compensation whenever the condemnor's activities reduce the landowner's income from activities such as hunting, bike races or even lambing. Likewise, exact compensation if cropland can no longer be sprayed or seeded by plane because of the elevated lines.

Require compensation for all livestock killed or injured as a result of the condemnor's operations. Compensation should include damages for any livestock or trophy game animals that escape when a fence is cut or a gate is left open, especially in cases of properties with high fences. Include the cost of rounding up the livestock and resulting damages from any diseases introduced into the herd. Require compensation if predators are introduced when fences are cut or gates left open.

Possibly agree to non-binding mediation to settle disputes when damages cannot be mutually agreed upon.

Generally, the parties share the mediation costs. Never waive the right to a jury trial or consent to binding arbitration. Provide for the recovery of attorney fees if the landowner prevails at trial.

Easement Maintenance

Require restoration of the land within the easement at the end of the construction

phase. Also, specify how frequently the easement must be maintained.

Some landowners may wish to deny the use of all chemicals (or certain chemicals) to control weeds and brush.

Require all trucks to be washed before entering the premises to prevent the spread of noxious weeds, especially deep-rooted perennials. Failure to do so makes the condemnor liable for their introduction.

In some areas of Texas, especially in the Hill Country, oak wilt poses a serious problem. Landowners may make the condemnor liable for the spread of oak wilt caused by its activities. Require all oak trees to be trimmed by hand or that all chainsaws and axes are disinfected before being used on oak trees. Require all cuts and scrapes on trees be treated immediately.

As wind turbines generate more and more electricity in Texas, the need for transmission lines increases. Landowners must understand the condemnation process and know how and what to negotiate to protect their property and property rights when confronted with the possibility of transmission lines on their land. 📌

Fambrough (judon@recenter.tamu.edu) is a member of the State Bar of Texas and a lawyer with the Real Estate Center at Texas A&M University.

THE TAKEAWAY

Wind energy production is increasing in Texas. Landowners can protect their interests by studying the many complicated issues related to the taking of land for transmission line easements. For example, the Texas Supreme Court in the 2004 Hubenak decision removed the requirement that condemnors make a bona fide effort to purchase the land based on fair market value. Likewise, condemnors can and will attempt to purchase more property and property rights than they can condemn.



MAYS BUSINESS SCHOOL

Texas A&M University
2115 TAMU
College Station, TX 77843-2115

<http://recenter.tamu.edu>
979-845-2031

Director, Gary W. Maler; **Chief Economist**, Dr. Mark G. Dotzour; **Communications Director**, David S. Jones; **Managing Editor**, Nancy McQuiston; **Associate Editor**, Bryan Pope; **Assistant Editor**, Kammy Baumann; **Art Director**, Robert P. Beals II; **Graphic Designer**, JP Beato III; **Circulation Manager**, Mark Baumann; **Typography**, Real Estate Center.

Advisory Committee

Ronald C. Wakefield, San Antonio, chairman; James Michael Boyd, Houston, vice chairman; Mona R. Bailey, North Richland Hills; Louis A. Cortes, China Grove; Jacquelyn K. Hawkins, Austin; Joe Bob McCartt, Amarillo; D. Marc McDougal, Lubbock; Kathleen McKenzie Owen, Pipe Creek; Barbara A. Russell, Denton; and John D. Eckstrum, Conroe, ex-officio representing the Texas Real Estate Commission.

Tierra Grande (ISSN 1070-0234) is published quarterly by the Real Estate Center at Texas A&M University, College Station, Texas 77843-2115. Subscriptions are free to Texas real estate licensees. Other subscribers, \$20 per year. Views expressed are those of the authors and do not imply endorsement by the Real Estate Center, Mays Business School or Texas A&M University. The Texas A&M University System serves people of all ages, regardless of socioeconomic level, race, color, sex, religion, disability or national origin. Photography/Illustrations: Real Estate Center files, p. 1; Judon Fambrough, p. 3.